
Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarship.claremont.edu/ppr

Part of the Music Practice Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://scholarship.claremont.edu/ppr/vol9/iss2/11

This Bibliography is brought to you for free and open access by the Current Journals at Scholarship @ Claremont. It has been accepted for inclusion in Performance Practice Review by an authorized editor of Scholarship @ Claremont. For more information, please contact scholarship@cuc.claremont.edu.
SURVEYS

Voices


Consider all high male voice types: falsetto, castrato, countertenor, male alto, male soprano. For Giles the true countertenor is a falsetto male alto who has developed a bright, clear tone. The countertenor head-voice uses the full length of folds and has developed “pharyngeal” singing between the basic and falsetto mechanisms. That “upper falsetto” (to which Caccini and others were averse) is the true falsetto is a misconception. As René Jacobs has indicated head-
register has two or three subregisters and all countertenors use falsetto as their chest voice.

Giles covers many areas: earlier writings on singing and descriptions of singers, choral groups (recent and historical), and composers' use of countertenors (Josquin, Purcell, Bach, Handel, et al.). Despite a glossary and index it is difficult to locate information (perhaps the book should have been a dictionary).

Pronunciation

A guide to pronunciations of the languages used in medieval and Renaissance music, including Classical Latin, Italian Latin, French Latin, Spanish Latin, Portuguese Latin, German Latin, Netherlands Latin, Anglo-Latin, Old French, Occitan, Catalan, Castillian, Galician-Portuguese, Italian, Middle High German, Late-medieval German and Early New High German, and Flemish (Dutch). A CD reading of selected texts (matching settings by Machaut, Josquin, Lasso, Byrd, and others) is provided.

Tempo

Tempo fluctuations in Japanese traditional music represented graphically by means of a computer program. Software is available, and the overall “picture” might meaningfully be transferred to a consideration of Western music.

Woodwind Instruments

The recorder (fistule, pipe, etc.) appears in Machaut’s list of instruments, although it was unknown in Italy until c1400. During the Renaissance it came to be favored by upper classes and participated often in consorts. Brown suggests as a possible scoring for mid-16th-century chansons or madrigals recorder (top) and viol (bottom) with virginals and/or lute in between—i.e. a proto-baroque instrumentation.


A useful survey, indicating when aspects of recorder technique were first described: Virdung (articulation), Ganassi (breath pressure, tonguing), Cardan (breath pressure, partially covered holes, vibrato), Jambe de Fer (buttressed fingering), The Compleat Flute-Master (fingered vibrato), Loulié (tonguing), Freillon-Poncein (fully chromatic fingering), Hotteterre (fingering for ornaments), Stanesby (tenor as standard), Michael Vetter, 1969 (avant-garde techniques).

Tuning


The music of different historical periods was affected by a prevalent tuning. In Landini’s cadences (e.g. b over d proceeding to c’ over c) the b beats jarringingly with d due to its Pythagorean tuning and was heard as a dissonance by contemporaries. In Bach’s Prelude in C (WTCl) the upper thirds at the beginning sound dull in 1/4 meantone, charming in 1/6 meantone, and uncomfortably nervous in equal temperament. L. Couperin’s works in b minor and f# minor accomodate themselves remarkably to the irregular tuning known as tempérament ordinaire. In his Passacaglia in G Minor
the $b^\flat$ sounds dark, the $e^\flat$ expressively dark, whereas $d-\text{f#}$ sounds as relaxed as $f-a$. Tellingly, Marais remarked that his Suite in F# could be transposed to G, but would be "less piercing." Various treatises of the 16th and 17th century inform us that fretted instruments normally used equal temperament.

THE NINTH TO THIRTEENTH CENTURIES

Added Notes

Ornaments


Ornaments were integrated into the neume shapes, and connected and separated calligraphy indicated connected and separated performance. Variants evidenced local dialects. Liquescent neumes had "a smooth glide" between two solid pitches (Guido). Repercussive neumes were likely performed as quick articulations on the same tone, a kind of "beating" (Aurelian of Réome).

THE SIXTEENTH CENTURY

Composers

Palestrina


In the Cappella Pontificia (1560-62) certain sections of the Mass ("Crucifixus," "Benedictus") were "highlighted" by being limited to solo singers, implying that other sections employed more than one to a part. Palestrina’s "workshop" (the Cappella Giulia) ordinarily had 6444, lesser Roman churches 4222 singers (the upper 6 and 4 taken by boys). "Tenebrae" and double-choir works were ordinarily performed with one voice per part.
Media

Voices


Processions and multiple choirs were often associated with special days (e.g. one celebrating the patron saint of a church). Lists of singers and instrumentalists indicate the numbers and dispositions of performing groups. Choirs could be doubled (e.g. two choirs on one set of parts, one choir on another). Multiple organs (often portable) and multiple conductors (relaying and coordinating) were also characteristic.

Keyboard Instruments

Approximately half the sixty or so surviving manuscripts (late-16th to early-17th century) contain fingerings. Ten sources are of particular importance. An initial program (based on exact pattern recognition) begins with a match of six fingerings and proceeds down to three. Another program deals with similar markings. Such analyses bear out the legitimacy of applying a given configuration to a comparable situation elsewhere.

String Instruments

Terzi’s lute books (1593, 1599) contain rubrics such as "a duoi" (for two lutes), "contrapunto" (an
ornamented arrangement), and “in concerto” (to be joined with a larger ensemble). Terzi’s intabulations provide clues for the arranging of contemporary polyphony into foundational and decorative instrumental voices.


The *Lira da Braccio* flourished during the first third of the 16th century but disappeared by the early 17th. Its slightly rounded or flat bridge made it ideal for chordal accompaniment (e.g. of dramatic recitations). Jones summarizes the shapes and types from extant instruments and works of art, providing charts of the kinds of strings, frets, pegs, etc.


“Tuning” on the vihuela does not concern specific pitch but rather the intervallic relations between the strings. (Conventionally, tuning was in respect to the highest string stretched to its maximum.) “Temperament” implied imagining the modal final in terms of the clefs (C and/or F). Because of equal temperament finals could appear anywhere on the strings. Bermudo’s “Art of Playing the *Vihuela*” (1555 Book) does not concern performance practice, but the manner of transposing of keyboard intabulations to the *vihuela*.

Brass Instruments


Distinguishes between kinds of trumpet used in Spain: the *clarín* (initially shorter and with a narrower bore), the *trompeta* (differing simply in register from the *clarín*), and the *trompeta bastarda* (not an s-shaped or slide trumpet, as is sometimes suggested).
Instrumental Ensembles


A theatrical presentation involved the lowering and raising of singers. Six angels, playing string instruments “made great music,” and seventeen trumpeters participated.

Tempo


Zacconi attempted to eliminate the ambiguities between tactus and signs of mensuration. He was, for example, opposed to using *z* if a breve tactus would make the rhythmic content too rapid. He was also concerned about disparities between rhythm and tactus, distinguishing between two types of ternary meter, one wherein all the parts were coordinated and one in which certain parts were rhythmically conflicted.

Added Notes

Ornamentation


Ortiz, Milan, and Santa Maria described the playing of and improvising with *consonancias* (chord successions). To provide a harmonization of a melodic line a bass was added, then filler lines. In Santa Maria intervals were reckoned from the bass—a changeover from the tenor-discant framework which prevailed earlier in the Renaissance.


Between c1530 and c1570 the single stroke was primarily a corrective sign, the double probably a shake,
and the triple uncertain (with one known instance). Between 1591 and c1650 (1570 to 1590 remains a gap) the single stroke may have been realized as a slide (although the later forefall / and backfall \, perhaps related, were each one-note ornaments). The double stroke often corresponded (by its positioning) to a written-out cadential shake, and the triple (still rare) may have been a combination single and double stroke (i.e. a grace preceding some other form of ornament).

Pitch


Phillips points to a handful of pieces around 1610 that contain five distinct voice parts—treble, mean, contratenor, tenor, and bass—in respect to which Wulstan’s theory of a minor third upward transposition (involving falsetto) seems too rigid, as does Bowers’s idea that contratenor and tenor were of essentially the same range and timbre.

**THE SEVENTEENTH CENTURY**

**Composers**

**Monteverdi**


Mensural theory (as espoused by Eberlein) is not applicable in Monteverdi’s time. \( \underline{\text{\( \frac{3}{2} \) \text{no longer}} \) govern breve and semibreve respectively, but always semibreve. 3/2 is the usual sign for triple meter, governing either three whole or three half notes. When passages in duple were rhythmically complex this necessitated that the corresponding passages in triple were slower in speed—such triple-time sections were hardly proportional.

Eberlein, Roland. “Nochmals zu den Taktwechseln in Monteverdis Marienvesper: eine Erwiderung auf

Holds that the Vespers should adhere to the proportions as notated, in contradistinction to Wolf’s thesis.


In the *Vespers* certain sections (the Mass, Lauda, and both Magnificats) require a downward transposition by 4th, due to the presence of high clefs. Similar high clefs are found in Schütz and Rigatti. Praetorius’s upper limit for soprano voice (*Eunuchus, Falsetista,* and *Discantista*) was e'' or f'', i.e. below Monteverdi’s (or Schütz’s) notated vocal parts. Giovanni Gabrieli sometimes wrote untransposing parts higher than this, but they were not labeled *voce*, and thus were almost certainly independent instrumental lines.

Giovanni Gabrieli


Fourteen partbooks of the 1615 *Symphoniae sacrae* (recently found in Warsaw) contain marginal comments concerning aspects of performance. Vocal soloists are specified by *voce*, choruses by *capella*. A *Geigen chor* (in *Salvator noster*) indicates that one or more parts were to be played by strings. For *Sancta et immaculata* an eighth part by Staden fills in open fifths and rectifies 6/4 sonorities.

Charpentier


Charpentier’s continuo practice—here examined in 550 works (in 28 ms. volumes)—varies according to genre. Verbal cues (such as of organ registrations) are
occasionally provided. The instrumental groupings are diverse, and sometimes continuo is not used at all.

Froberger

Frescobaldi’s rhythmic freedoms (Preface, 1616 Book) most likely affected Froberger’s keyboard performance. His success in Paris may have derived from his expansion on the note text, a procedure evidenced in L. Couperin’s *Prélude a limitation de Mr froberger*, wherein the opening chords of a Froberger toccata are broken into successive notes.

L. Couperin

In *pré-ludes non mésurés* slurs indicate *liaisons*, the holding of each note successively, accumulating into a chord. This procedure, however, as Saint Lambert explains, is sometimes more subtle, as in the succession $b^b-f##-g$, where $b^b$ and $g$ are held, while $f##$ is treated as a momentary appoggiatura, similar to an *acciaccatura*.

Purcell

In 1677 Purcell became “Composer to the 24 Violins,” an ensemble sometimes subdivided into two groups of 12 for the London theaters where Purcell’s semi-operas were being presented. The 24 usually played without continuo, the group’s function being primarily (as in France) to play for singers, either solo or choral. Wind instruments (recorders and bassoons) were added beginning with the Odes (1680-95), trumpets and oboes in later Purcell.
Corelli


Considers Corelli’s Op. 4 no. 8 in light of recent research and finds that each aspect of its performance is capable of being realized in more than one way, but that each of these ways still fell within certain acceptable parameters.


Although Corelli himself left no variations for his Op. 5 dance movements, a number of his successors, including Dubourg and Tartini, did, thereby continuing in a tradition that went back to Biber and Matteis.


Discusses various performance questions in respect to recent recordings of Op. 5. *Violone o cimbalo* (on the title page) may feasibly imply a cello, considering some of the active bass lines, and an Italian-style harpsichord. The *o* probably meant “and/or,” although some movements lend themselves to an accompaniment by harpsichord or by cello alone. But the recordings leave us with a number of questions. Should other instruments (e.g. lute, guitar) be added—as in one recording? Should the harpsichord add *accciacature* a-la-Gasparini—as in another? In the adagio of Sonata no. 5 should only the second of the two repeated sections be ornamented—as in still another?


Corelli’s rather restrained ornaments for the slow movements of his op. 5 stand in distinct contrast to the ever more elaborate versions of his successors, which extended to other movements as well (Zaslaw provides a table of all the known sets). Roger’s invitation (in 1716) that anyone might examine Corelli’s original, lends credence to their genuineness, as do descriptions
of Corelli’s demonically inspired (= improvisatory?) manner of performance.

Media

Voices and Instruments

Incidental music was a part of many of Molière’s plays. From the account books the disposition of the orchestra and continuo can be reconstructed. In 1661 (music by Beauchamps) a five-part string orchestra (violin, 3 violas, cello or viol) was utilized, which by 1672 (music by Charpentier) had changed to four parts (2 violins, viola, cello or viol). Molière’s wife Armande sang on stage, but often the actors simply mimicked (the actual singers being hidden in boxes).

String Instruments

17th-century treatises describing lute performance (e.g. Nicolas Vallet, 1618; Mersenne, 1636; Denis Gaultier, 1672) and guitar performance (e.g. François Martin, 1663; Francisque Corbett, 1670, 1672; Robert de Visée, 1682) provide symbols and descriptions of the tremblement, flattement, martellement, tirade, and tenue. Interpretation can depend upon the nature of the instrument and performer subjectivity.


What kind of lute served a particular repertory? A Renaissance lute of 9 or 10 courses (plus added bass) was in general use c1613. Double-strung 12 course theorbo lutes (of the type invented by J. Gaultier) most likely accompanied a vast literature of song (W. and H. Lawes, Wilson, Locke). French lutes were plausibly substituted for English around mid-century, whereas
Italian lutes remained virtually unknown (Talbot fails to mention them). Larger lutes (archlutes) came to be preferred in the second half of the century.


The cello appeared in the first decades of the 16th century. Known as *basso de braccio* or *violone*, it was used mostly in popular contexts prior to the 17th century. Mersenne (1636) described the bowing of trills and production of the *flattement* and Corrette (1741) was the first to present modern chromatic fingering.

**Woodwind Instruments**


Reduces the tally of known surviving Hotteterre flutes from three to one. Some confusion has prevailed concerning replicas, reproductions, and modern specimens.

**Brass Instruments**


Lully's scores often contain the rubric "trompettes" above the first violin part. But various sources, including Philidor's arrangements, show that Lully frequently intended trumpet elsewhere as well. He wrote high (cléron) and virtuosic parts, paralleling or preceding the late-17th-century Italian trumpet style.


In Scottish and English funeral ceremonies trumpets fulfilled contrasting symbolic roles: triumphant and mourning. Documents allude to "open" and "closse" trumpets, the one involving militaristic calls,
the other mort or mournful sounds. Some evidence associates the latter with the use of mutes and with the minor mode.

Thorough bass


Organ accompaniment was frequent in chamber and theater (as well as in church) music. The registration was adjusted to the number of voices being accompanied, for instance in Monteverdi’s Vespers 1-3 voices by principal, 4-6 by principal and ottava, 6-7 by principal, ottava, and quintadecima, 7 and more by organo pleno.

Pitch and Tuning

Pitch


Mezzo punto referred to the diapason most current, tutto punto to the diapason a semitone lower. Tono corista was applied to a vocal composition regularly a major 2nd below mezzo punto. Organists had to adopt to vocal pitch by transposing (most organs had a high tuning of c470). Strumenti coristi (including transverse flutes and cornetti muti) were generally in mezzo punto, c409.

THE EARLY EIGHTEENTH CENTURY

Composers

Heinichen


In a number of Heinichen’s sacred works overall time durations are provided, extending to particular movements. Most pertinent are two Kyries, a Psalm, a Hymn, and a Pastorale. Heinichen’s tempo designa-
tions allow us to rethink the pace of similar movements found in Handel and Corelli.

Bach

Bach’s Voices and Instruments

In Bach’s Trauerode two lutes (most likely in the first and last movements) and two gambas (both instruments probably in an obbligato role) added a distinctive color (associated with royalty and death?). The harpsichord may also have been drawn upon selectively, possibly for the aria “Wie starb die Hel- din?” Dual accompaniment (harpischord and organ) seems unlikely. Single partbooks remain for voice and wind parts and for violin 1, violin 2, and viola. Three parts are present for the continuo (two of them fi-gured). The partbooks may give evidence of one, or possibly two, per part.

Bach’s Keyboard Instruments

Although most of Bach’s organ music lacks registration, a number of contemporary sources throw light on his possible practice. Bach admired Silbermann’s “thundering basses,” and his coupling was also an option. Bach desired to use “all stops together” on the rebuilt St. Blasius organ, and his recommendations called for more schallmey and cantabile. Today we should not think so much of limiting as of expanding the coloristic potentialities.

Bach’s Ornaments

Kuhnau, and Walther prior to him, indicated that the accentus (a one-note ornament) was to be rendered delicately. This offers a clue for Bach (as in WTCIIii
Bach’s Ornaments

Prelude or *Sinfonia* no. 5 in E\textsuperscript{b}) in which this ornament is conventionally played with stress (like an appoggiatura) rather than softly.

Bach’s Thorough Bass


Despite various bits of evidence, we actually know very little as to how Bach realized his basses. Anecdotes, such as those of Mizler, Kittel, or Forkel, were written considerably after the fact, especially in regard to Bach’s cantata practice of c1714 and shortly after. Heinichen is more a propos to Hamburg or Dresden than to Leipzig or Weimar. Were Bach’s accompaniments unobtrusive? Were they texturally complex? Were they sometimes full-voiced? No reliable witness is available to inform us.

Tempo


As did Delalande, Blanchard and Madin provided minutes and seconds for several of their works. Sacred works appear to have been rendered more slowly than secular. Surprisingly, markings such as *legerement* or *gayement* are associated with relatively slow tempi.

Media

String Instruments


A wooden wheel rubs against six strings (two melodic, four drone). Special sound effects are possible, such as *enfles* (swells) or *coup de poignet* (a technique called upon to detach successive notes).
Woodwind Instruments

The baroque clarinet (composed for by Vivaldi, Handel, and others) was essentially an “upper-12th” instrument. “2 clarinettes” ordered from Jacob Denner in 1710 constitutes the earliest known reference. The lower 12th was still best represented by the chalumeau (still called for by Gluck in the 1760s).

Thorough Bass

Heinichen spent time in Italy and was influenced by Gasparini—he considered acciaccature “a grand effect.” Heinichen’s 1728 treatise gives particular attention to the dissonant formations encountered in Italian theatrical works.


Boutmy’s 28-page treatise (c1770) is here translated. His realizations show typical melodic configurations, possibly adapted from the music of his own time.

Tempo
<

Miehling, Klaus. “Autographe Aufführungsduerangaben in der Kirchenmusik von J.D. Heinichen.” Cited above as item 40.

Altered Notes

Rhythmic Alterations


Proposes that Italian as well as French late baroque music made use of inequality. The problem lies in the unit of pulse. French music adhered to a 16th-century tradition and favored a minim (♩) pulse, whereby inequality was associated with the ♩. Italian music by 1650, however, had gone over to a semiminim (♩)
pulse, making \( \frac{\text{\textbullet}}{\text{\textbullet}} \) subject to inequality. Therefore, when Loulié or Corrette told performers to perform equally in Italian music, we should not assume that the Italians never adopted inequality. Moreover, in Corelli and his contemporaries many pieces lacked the \( \frac{\text{\textbullet}}{\text{\textbullet}} \), thus precluding inequality.

**THE LATE EIGHTEENTH CENTURY**

**Composers**

Haydn


Haydn’s manuscripts (the largest collection found in the National Library in Budapest) yield valuable clues, as do contemporary theorists (C.P.E. Bach being foremost). Haydn’s keyboard instruments and the mechanical organ (with pieces realized by Niemecz) are also revealing. A number of ambiguities remain, however: dynamics (often incompletely marked), dotted notes and triplets (some synchronized, some not), the nature of turns (Haydn’s notation is inconsistent), the speed of trills, the character of cadenzas (Haydn did notate one c1780), and the nature of embellished repeats (the Variations in F Minor might offer a basis).

**Keyboard Instruments**


The Italian cembalo con martellini, cimbalo a martelli, and cembalo senza penne became known as Hammerflügel, Pyramidenflügel, or Tafelklaviere in German-speaking lands. The word Flügel alone was ambiguous, and could refer to either a harpsichord or a piano. Pianos were present in South Germany and Saxony from the 1720s onward and a “Flügel without quills” (a piano) was already advertised in Vienna in
1725. Haydn may have become acquainted with the piano early in life in Vienna.

String Instruments


Documents and pictures illustrate changes in the harp during the 18th century. Cousineau (in 1782) refined Hochbrucker’s system of seven pedals (devised in 1697). This “single-pedal” harp was the type Mozart employed in his Concerto for Flute and Harp.


During the 18th century the guitar was successfully used in accompanying the voice, although it was more modest in sound than the harpsichord or theorbo. Various tunings were described in method books, 1760-1800: 4 (plus one single), 5, and 6 double, or 5, 6, 7, or 8 single.

Woodwind Instruments


The basset horn commands a 4-octave range with a strong bass and semi-veiled upper register. It was prominently used, for example, in Mozart’s *Requiem* and Strauss’s *Zwei Gesänge* and *Elektra*.


For Mozart a 5-8 key clarinet is suitable, for Weber a Grenser copy with at least 10 keys. By the second decade of the 19th century clarinet tone had become
powerful. The tutors show that at first the reed was held against the top lip, although Stadler (Mozart’s performer) had already held the reed below, and by 1831 at the Paris Conservatoire the reed below became official. The articulated performing style of Mozart’s day (unlike today’s smooth and seamless approach) is worth recapturing.


The clarinet’s development reflected current musical styles. The 5-keyed instrument was the standard in the Classical period. Additions in the keywork during the 19th century facilitated chromaticism and allowed the tone to be more even as well as more resonant. The basset horn in A or B♭ was invented in Passau in 1770, but the basset clarinet was likely chosen by Mozart for his late clarinet works.

Thorough Bass

Rellstab in 1789 pointed to a changed taste in Generalbass, involving the “art of accompanying melodically.” When figures are present in a late century work we need to enquire from whence they came, from the composer or from a publisher or arranger.

Tempo

In the later 18th century the “old” minuet (e.g. dotted half, 46) and the newer (e.g. dotted half, 126) were each being drawn upon. Niemecz’s clocks (1789-93) give evidence of Haydn’s use of both kinds. In Don Giovanni a single beat of the old minuet was equivalent to one bar of the German dance (i.e. of the new minuet).
Added Notes

Thorough bass

60. Bötticher, Jörg-Andreas. “‘Regeln des Generalbasses,’
eine Berliner Handschrift des späten 18. Jahrhun-
derts.” *Basler Jahrbuch für historische Musikpra-

A treatise from the end of the 18th century holds
special interest for its 400 pages of thorough bass re-
alizations, including examples of Handel, C.P.E. Bach,
Graun, Corelli, and J.S. Bach.

THE NINETEENTH CENTURY

Composers

Beethoven

61. Badura-Skoda, Eva. “Ein vierter erhaltenener Hammer-
flügel aus dem Besitz Beethovens.” *Dem Cembalo
ein Leben: eine Gedenkschrift für Isolde Ahlgrim.*

Three pianos are known to have been owned by
Beethoven: an Erard (Linz), Broadwood (Budapest),
and Graf (Bonn). A fourth piano, a gift from Graf, was
also in Beethoven’s possession in 1823. Very few of
such four-stringed instruments are preserved.

Chopin

*The Cambridge Companion to Chopin*, ed. Jim
Samson. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press,

Chopin habitually changed his ornamentation and
added fiorituras after his works were published. Liszt,
Bülow, and Tausig changed further details. Only be-
tween 1918 and 1939 was the published text made
sacrosanct.

Verdi

63. Rosen, David. “The Premiere, Subsequent Perfor-
mance History, and Performing Practices.” *Verdi:

Verdi directed his Requiem seven times, usually with 200 to 280 performers. The strings were unregulated in their bowing and played with limited vibrato; the trombones had valves. As for soloists, Verdi had particular voices in mind, for instance the soprano Teresa Stolz, who could sing securely and powerfully up to c'''

Verdi once remarked, “one mustn’t sing this Mass in the way one sings an opera; phrasing and dynamics that may be fine in the theater wont satisfy me at all.”


Verdi (from Oberto to Aida) designated his lowest brass parts cimbasso. What was this instrument? From 1820 to 1835 a corno basso was a wooden instrument called cimbasso (or simbasso) in musician’s jargon. The word cimbasso was perpetuated even after the corno basso was replaced by the ophicleid (invented 1817) or bombardon. Verdi’s cimbasso, therefore, may often have been a bombardon, although for Otello he expressed a preference for the contrabass trombone over the bombardon since it blended better with the other brass instruments.

Bruckner


The notion of a “definitive or most-authentic version of any symphony” is regarded as misguided. Instead of nine symphonies we have 18 symphonic essays, each an independently composed work: symphonies 00, 0, 5, 6, 7, 9 (one version); 1, 2, 8 (two versions); 3, 4 (three versions). Nowak began by publishing final versions, but later on added the initial and middle versions of several symphonies.

66. Gault, Dermot. “For Later Times: 100 Years after the Composer’s Death, Are We Any Nearer a “Defini-

Perhaps not. Haas’s editions of Bruckner’s Symphonies no. 2 and 8 are inauthentic amalgams. Nowak’s editions make available all versions of Symphonies no. 3, 4, and 8. In regard to no. 8, Bruckner’s last version of 1890 is less phantasmagoric and less dramatic than that of 1887.

**Mahler**


Mahler conducted his Second Symphony thirteen times and the autograph scores provide evidences of various changes, especially as regards tempi. At the end of the first movement “Tempo 1” (i.e. MM. 84) seems too slow. In the autograph this is changed: the beginning is marked “Maestoso,” the ending “Allegro.”

**Woodwind Instruments**


The bass clarinet came into its own in the late 19th (e.g. in Wagner, Tchaikovsky, Verdi, and Strauss) and the early 20th century (in Mahler, Stravinsky, Prokofiev, and Schoenberg). The contrabass appears in Schoenberg’s *Five Orchestral Pieces* and in Ligeti’s *Lontano*.


If composers called for the C clarinet for coloristic, rather than for merely technical reasons, their wishes should be respected. Thus a C clarinet is appropriate for the Beethoven Ninth (Scherzo), the *Symphonie fantastique*, *Les Preludes*, *Faust Symphony*, and the Brahms Fourth (Scherzo). The C clarinet had a harder
tone than the B♭, although the French (e.g. at the Paris Conservatoire) called it brilliant and lively.


The D clarinet was normally employed in the early 18th century (e.g. the two clarinets in Handel’s Overture). In the late 19th and 20th centuries it was called upon for its special color (it is most effective from c” to f”’). It represents Till Eulenspiegel. The E♭ clarinet was drawn upon for special effects by Mahler, Stravinsky, Schoenberg, and others. Clarinets in F, G, and A♭ have been used mainly in military and stage bands.

Brass Instruments

Tempo

Considers 19th-century metronome markings in the light of their plausibility. Beethoven’s inner image was probably out of touch with actual performance. Kolisch took a more intuitive approach, allowing a certain variability. Talsma’s theory (that fast markings were to be at half speed) seems inappropriate—Chopin’s Études, for example, would have been too slow to really exercise the pianist’s fingers.

THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

Composers

Scriabin
Nine of Scriabin's (1908, 1910) recordings on Hupfeld and Welte-Mignon reproducing pianos have recently been released. The Welte-Mignon reproduced the pitches, rhythm, tempi, dynamics, and pedaling (damper and soft). The dynamic range, however, is narrower than in an actual performance, and the recordings did not capture half and quarter pedalings (in whose use Scriabin was apparently a master). Compared to his published scores, Scriabin frequently added or changed notes. Nearly every measure contains slight tempo shifts (rubato). Scriabin's phrases, symmetrical (and dull) on paper, come out as markedly asymmetrical in performance.

Reger

Shows how Reger might have played one of his chorale preludes. As a student of Riemann Reger would have been especially sensitive to agogic accents, to interpreting patterns as beginning on upbeats, to rising to a highpoint with a crescendo and accellerando, and to declining from it with a rallentando and diminuendo. The degree of detail is staggering; almost every note is nuanced or shaded in some manner.

Schoenberg

Schoenberg's performance was guided by the mind rather than by sentimentalities. All the elements of performance were present in the notes themselves. Schoenberg indicated every detail with the utmost care, each musical idea was individualized and precisely demarcated. As a result every part stood out clearly within a polyphonic texture.

Rachmaninoff
Rachmaninoff recorded several of his own works, sometimes more than once. The recordings generally remain close to the printed versions. In his playing he tended to clarify the polyphonic textures, and to make certain musical elements more emphatic. He was able to shape seemingly diverse patterns into a convincing whole. His departures consisted in added accellerandos (leading to climaxes) and in imaginatively varying sequentially repeated ideas.

Shostokovich


Shostokovich recorded 199 pieces of his own work (a list is provided). Of these 90 were slower than is marked in the score, 30 more rapid, 79 identical (to within one notch on a metronome). This assumes the basic tempo to be the one the composer established in the first two measures. Shostokovich’s later decline in pianistic technique may have affected his precision, but not his tempo.

Boulez


In Boulez’s Third Sonata the performer must choose to include or omit various optional passages. This is a challenge in that the choices can upset the palindromic symmetry.

Tempo


A computer tempo-program has the advantage of accuracy (although human error can still account for a discrepancy of one decimal place). The computer is also able to store and make comparative graphs of hundreds of performances. Bowen’s analysis concentrates on changes of tempo in the “second theme.” Surprisingly perhaps, Toscanini was prone to the sudden shifts of pace characteristic of early 20th-century (Wagnerian-style) conducting.
Tuning


20th-century instrumental intonation is exaggeratedly Pythagorean, with sharpened major 3rds and major 6ths, creating a tense effect, whereby melody is pulling against the underlying harmony. The excessive vibrato does have the advantage of being a mitigating effect.

REFLECTIONS ON PERFORMANCE PRACTICE


Performance practice has been misinterpreted as implying that there is only one true way to realize a musical work. In respect to Corelli’s Op. 4 no. 8 Duffin shows that each aspect of performance can be realized somewhat differently, although the variety is nonetheless circumscribed, fitting into a particular range of historical acceptability.

< Williams, Peter. “Johann Sebastian and the Basso Continuo.” Cited above as item 44.

Shows how uncertain historical evidence can be when considered in light of a composer’s own time. Anecdotes by Forkel, Mizler, and others have hitherto been given credence, although their relation to fact is quite tenuous.


Sets apart the composer’s work (the text) and the performer’s personal version (or “arrangement”) of it. Each might be considered “artworks” in their own right. Performance practice has attempted to close (or even eliminate) the gap. Concert audiences, on the other hand, have clung to (and indeed cherished) the individuality and interpretative independence of performers. Kivy pleads for two authenticities, that of the composer and that of the performer, each relevant in its own way. The ultimate test is in the listening.

The views of participants in an international symposium held at the Jerusalem Music Centre (28 May–1 June 1995).

Menachem Brinker: In an art work (a musical performance) some aspects are determinate in their following of the author’s (the composer’s) intention, others indeterminate, requiring a “filling in” by the performer. Without such a “filling in,” the aesthetic result may be inauthentic.

Zvi Meniken: In respect to musical arrangements of Bach and Rameau, is the original sound essential to authenticity?

Laszlo Somfai: Bartók’s recordings continuously change the tempos, dynamics, ornaments, and even the pitch content of his own scores. Is there then, a final version?

Laurence Dreyfus: Donington’s recommendation for scholarly study on the one hand and for intuitive performance on the other is seen as paradoxical and reflects a dichotomy that has its origins in the Romantic era.

Neal Zaslaw: Being well-informed and musically sensitive may be regarded as reciprocal activities.


Introductory remarks to Richard Taruskin’s collected essays and reviews concerning performance practice (historical performance, early music). Taruskin seeks to undo a “stifling regimen inflicted on performers.” Performance practice is characterized as prescriptive, conformist, and norm-shaping. Moreover, it is not really historical at all, but rather a reflection of the tastes and values of our own time (the Stravinsky aesthetic). Taruskin presents a first-person account of how he came to be suspicious of and ultimately disillu-
sioned by what he regards to be the inflated and unrealistic claims of historical performance.


The consideration of 100 years of recorded sound, now facilitated by CHARM (The Centre for the History and Analysis of Recorded Music, University of Southampton, 1995-), is valuable in many ways. By surveying a wide range of recordings we come to a clearer perception of historical trends. We are also able to single out the nature of performance at a particular time and place (e.g. Paris during the 1920s). Particular performers can be studied in depth (e.g. all of Karajan’s versions of the Fifth). And the approach of an individual can more easily be compared with the general practice of a time. Performance practice has concentrated on the “text” and on the external sounds. Performance analysis aspires to something broader by incorporating the social and aesthetic qualities of a time.


A reply to Taruskin’s Text and Act (see 83). (T) So-called “historical” performance is but a reflection of our own time; (J) historical performance has enhanced our sense of the past. (T) Editions have promoted literalness and conformity; (J) editions are but the starting-point of performance practice. (T) Performance practice has inhibited spontaneity; (J) in numerous ways it has allowed for individuality of interpretation. (T) The meaning of musical works changes over time, depending upon audience response; (J) musical works retain intrinsic qualities that await our rediscovery. (T) Recent historical performances have become more “authentic” because of their appeal to modern audiences; (J) such performances are more “authentic” in that they have profited from the research of the past 50 years.

The wide-ranging study of recorded sound has distinct benefits for performance practice, especially in regard to composers who have performed their own works. Recordings also allow us to sense more fully the qualities of early 20th-century performance; recapturing the irregular rhythms, rubatos, selective portamenti, and occasional vibratos of that time represents a final frontier for performance practice.
AUTHOR INDEX
(of 1995-1996 Bibliography)

Badura-Skoda, Eva. 52, 61
Baratz, Lewis Reece. 49
Bötticher, Jörg-Andreas. 60
Bowen, José A. 78, 84
Bredenbach, Ingo. 73
Brown, Howard Mayer. 4
Buelow, George J. 48
Burstyn, Shai. 82
Byrt, John. 50
Cahis, Juan I. 65
Charteris, Richard. 23
Christiansen, Clay. 42
Court, Suzanne. 11
DeFord, Ruth I. 16
Dobrée, Georgina. 55
Downey, Peter. 36
Duffin, Ross. 27<, 80
Eberlein, Roland. 21
Freis, Wolfgang. 13
Gault, Dermot. 66
Giles, Peter. 1
Gottschewski, Hermann. 3
Green, Robert A. 46
Harbinson, William G. 77
Harris, C. David. 43
Harris, Michael. 60
Haynes, Bruce. 39
Holman, Peter. 27
Hunter, Desmond. 18
Jackson, Roland. 85, 86
Jones, Sterling Scott. 12
Kaplan, Gilbert E. 67
Kinzler, Hartmuth. 71
Kivy, Peter. 81
Kolisch, Rudolf. 74
Lasocki, David. 5
Lawson, Colin. 47, 56, 69
Leedy, Douglas. 79
Leikin, Anatole. 72
Lindley, Mark. 6
Malloch, William. 59
Martin, Colette. 32
McGee, Timothy. 2, 7
McGrattan, Alexander. 37
Methuen-Campbell, James. 62
Meucci, Renato. 64, 70<
Miehling, Klaus. 40, 43, 49<
Milliot, Sylvette. 53
Morehen, John. 10
Morelli, Arnaldo. 38
Moshevich, Sofia. 76
O'Regan, Noel. 8, 9
Parrott, Andrew. 22
Pascual, Beryl Kenyon de. 14
Philips, Peter. 19
Powell, Ardal. 35
Powell, John S. 31
Prevost, Paul. 26
Rampe, Siegbert. 25
Rapp, Regula. 58
Ribouillault, Danielle. 54
Rifkin, Joshua. 41
Roig-Francoli, Miguel A. 17
Ros-Fábregas, Emilio. 15
Rosen, David. 63
Sadler, Graham. 24
Sayce, Linda. 33
Seletsky, Robert E. 28
Shackleton, Nicholas. 57
Somfai, László. 51
Taruskin, Richard. 83
Tschaikov, Basil. 70
Thompson, Shirley. 24
Vanscheeuwijck, Marc. 34
Walls, Peter. 29
Williams, Peter. 44, 80<
Wolf, Uwe. 20
Xiao-Li, Ding. 75
Zaslaw, Neal. 30
SUBJECT INDEX

accompaniment: on 16th c. Roman organs, 9

authenticity, 81, 82, 85

Bach, C.P.E.: and thorough bass, 60

Bach, Johann Sebastian: and organ registration, 42; and ornaments, 43; and thorough bass, 44, 60; and tuning, 6; Trauerode, 41

bass clarinet, 68

basset horn, 55

Beethoven, Ludwig van: and the piano, 61

Blanchard, Esprit: and tempo, 45

Boulez, Pierre: and Third Sonata, 77

Boutmy, Jean-Joseph: and thorough bass, 49

brass instruments, in the 19th c. (cimbasso, bombardon, contrabass trombone), 64

Bruckner, Anton, symphonies, 65, 66

Cardan, Jerome: and recorder, 5

castrato, 1
cello, in baroque, 34

chanson: and 16th-c. scoring, 4

CHARM, 84

Charpentier, Marc-Antoine: and continuo, 24

choir: and dispositions in Renaissance, 19; and sizes in 16th c. Rome, 8, 9

Chopin, Fryderyk, 62

cimbasso: and Verdi, 64

clarinet: before 1750, 47; development of, 57, historical, 56, high, 70; in C, 69

The Compleat Flute-Master: and recorder performance, 5

conducting, in the 20th c., 78

consonancias, in 16th-c. Spain, 17

continuo: and 17th-c. Italian organ, 38

Corelli, Arcangelo: and dance variations, 28; and ornaments, 30; and thorough bass, 60; and Op. 5 recordings, 29

counter-tenor, 1

Couperin, Louis: and Froberger, 25; and préludes non mesurés, 26; and tuning, 6

ensembles: and lutes in 16th c., 11

falsetto, 1

fingering, keyboard, in Elizabethan England, 10

flute: and Hotteterre, 35

Freillon-Poncein, Jean Pierre: and recorder fingering, 5

Froberger, Johann, 25

Gabrieli, Giovanni: and singers and accompaniment, 23

Ganassi, Silvestro di: and recorder, 5

Graun, Johann Gottlieb: and thorough bass, 60

guitar, in 18th c., 54

Haydn, Franz Joseph, keyboard sonatas, 51

Handel, Georg Friedrich: and thorough bass, 60

harp, in 18th c., 53

head-voice, 1

Heinichen, Johann David: and tempo, 40, and thorough bass, 48

hurdy gurdy, in 18th c., 46

inequality: and pulse, 50

intonation, in 20th c., 79

Jacobs, René: and counter-tenor voice, 1

Jambe de Fer, Philibert: and recorder performer, 5

Landini, Francesco: and tuning, 6

lira da braccio, 12

Loulie', Etienne: and recorder tonguing, 5

lute: and 16th c. ensembles, 11; and 17th-18th c. continuo, 33

Machaut, Guillaume: and recorder, 4

Madin, Henri: and tempo, 45

madrigal, and 16th-c. scoring, 4
Mahler, Gustav, Second Symphony, 67
male alto, 1
male soprano, 1
Marais, Marin: and tuning, 6
mensuration and tactus, in Monteverdi, 20, 21
minuet: and tempo in 18th c., 59
Molière: and incidental music, 31
Monteverdi, Claudio: and proportions, 20, 21; and transposition, 22
neumes (liquecent, repercussive): and ornamentation, 7
orchestra: and Molière, 31; and Purcell, 27
organ registration: and 17th-c.
Italy, 38; and J.S. Bach, 42
ornaments: in Middle Ages, 7; and Elizabethan strokes, 18; on lute and guitar, 32
Palestrina, Giovanni Pierluigi: and choir sizes, 8
pitch, in No. Italy in 16th and 17th c., 39
piano, in 18th c. Vienna, 52
pronunciation, of medieval and Renaissance music, 2
Purcell, Henry, and the orchestra, 27
Rachmaninoff, Sergei, 75
recorder, in Middle Ages and Renaissance, 4; instruction books, 5
recordings, value for performance study, 84, 86
reflections on performance practice, 80-86
Reger, Max, and agogic accents, 73
Riemann, Hugo: and Reger, 73
Schoenberg, Arnold, 74
Scriabin, Alexander: and piano performance, 72
Shostokovich, Dmitri: and tempo, 76
Stanesby, Thomas: and recorder performance, 5
tactus and mensuration, in Zacconi, 16
tempo: and Heinichen’s sacred music, 40; and Blanchard, 45; and Madin, 45; and minuet, 59; and “second theme,” 78; and Shostokovich, 76; and Talsma’s theory, 71; and computer applications, 3, 78
theatrical presentations, in 16th c., 15
thorough bass, in Heinichen, 48; in Boutmy, 49; in late 18th c., 58, 60
transposition, in Monteverdi, 22
trompet, in Renaissance Spain, 14; in 17th c. France, 36; in 17th c. Scotland and England, 37
tuning: and music history, 6; and vihuela, 13
Verdi, Giuseppe: Requiem, 63
Vetter, Michael, and modern recorder performance, 5
vihuela de mano, 13
Virdung, Sebastian: and recorder, 5
Welte-Mignon: and Scriabin performance, 72
Zacconi, Lodovido, 16